# Contemporary international and national experience in integrating technology in courts

Hon. Dr. Abeline Dorothea (Dory) Reiling mag. Iur.

#### CV

- Dory Reiling mag. lur. PhD
- www.doryreiling.com
- www.doryreiling.blogspot.com
- @doryontour
- dory@doryreiling.com



#### 1986 – 2018 judge, senior judge

2018 – Teaching and advice

2013-2018 Quality and Innovation program KEI

2012 – Knowledge systems, Innovation Program

2011 – Council of Europe CCJE Opinion 14

2009 – PhD in Technology for judicial reform

Senior judicial reform expert World Bank Information Manager NL judiciary

Senior judge



#### 1998 – 2003 NL judiciary information manager

2018 – Teaching and advice

2013-2018 Quality and Innovation program KEI

2012 – Knowledge systems, Innovation Program

2011 – Council of Europe CCJE Opinion 14

2009 – PhD in Technology for judicial reform

Senior judicial reform expert World Bank

Information Manager NL judiciary

Senior judge



#### 2004-2007 senior judicial reform expert, World Bank

2018 – Teaching and advice

2013-2018 Quality and Innovation program KEI

2012 – Knowledge systems, Innovation Program

2011 – Council of Europe CCJE Opinion 14

2009 – PhD in Technology for judicial reform

Senior judicial reform expert World Bank

Information Manager NL judiciary

Senior judge



#### 2007 – 2009 PhD



#### What do we talk about when we say IT?

#### • Back office

- Registration database
- Document production
- Research

#### Courtroom technology

- Digital case file
- Hearing recording
- Videoconferencing
- E-filing
  - Interface
  - Platform
- Public information

# Some findings

- Disposition time, access to justice and corruption are related issues
- Long disposition times
  - discourage access to justice and
  - foster some types of corruption
- Access to justice is more than access to courts
- It is primarily access to information
- Information technology can reduce corruption
  - But that depends on the political context

#### Opportunities

- Improving impartiality and integrity
- Interaction with outside world
- Improving court processes
  - Case management,
  - Court management
- Improving access to justice
  - Disintermediation

- Working information-driven
- Process information
- Statistics
- Case load
- Comparing courts

Why is court IT so difficult? Challenges, and some experience

- Complexity
  - Political
  - Technical
  - Court processes
  - Things will take longer than you think
- Governance
  - Who is in charge of what?
- Culture:
  - Judges' work is to look back, not ahead
  - It is about deciding who gets the blame for what went wrong

#### 2011- Council of Europe CCJE Opinion 14 expert

2018 – Teaching and advice

2013-2018 Quality and Innovation program KEI

2012 – Knowledge systems, Innovation Program

2011 – Council of Europe CCJE Opinion 14

2009 – PhD in Technology for judicial reform Senior judicial reform expert World Bank Information Manager NL judiciary Senior judge

Judge



Strasbourg, France, Consultative Council of European Judges

#### 2013 – 2018 Quality and Innovation Program

#### 2018 – Teaching and advice

#### 2013-2018 Quality and Innovation program KEI

2012 – Knowledge systems, Innovation Program

2011 – Council of Europe CCJE Opinion 14
2009 – PhD in Technology for judicial reform
Senior judicial reform expert World Bank

Information Manager NL judiciary

Senior judge



#### Communication tools: A complete transaction

- 1. Static web site
- 2. Downloading a form
- 3. Submitting a form
- 4. A complete transaction



# A fully digital civil procedure



#### Findings

- Improvements
- Faster processing
- More transparency
- Active judicial case management
- Issues
- Complexity
- Implementation
- Governance
- Users are your friends and your enemies

#### 2018 – teaching and advice

#### 2018 – Teaching and advice

2013-2018 Quality and Innovation program KEI

2012 – Knowledge systems, Innovation Program

2011 – Council of Europe CCJE Opinion 14 2009 – PhD in Technology for judicial reform Senior judicial reform expert World Bank Information Manager NL judiciary Senior judge



#### Courts are part of a cloud

- Courts start with people who have a problem
- Court decisions may not solve the problem
- Courts work with other institutions
  - Prosecution
  - Government and Aministration
  - Social services
  - Other institutions

#### Digital by design – some examples

- Designed to maximise advantages of IT
- Digital only
- CRT digital tribunal
- Moneyclaim one trick pony
- Demander justice private portal
- ODR in US

# Lessons from the pandemic

# How are justice institutions coping with covid?

#### • Justice institutions

- 53 % mostly closed
- 46% mostly use videoconferencing
- 35% implemented emergency laws
- 24% open with physical distancing measures
- 23%: mostly accessible for e-filing cases
- 15% operate mostly through phone lines
- 4% operate as usual
- 3% none of the above

• Source: International Association of Judges

# Video or remote hearings

- Regulation
- Legal basis:
- EU regulation on remote witness hearing
- COVID-19: Not just witnesses, also parties and judges remote
- Emergency legislation for pandemic
- With/without party consent?
- Judiciary practice rules/guidelines

#### Video or remote hearings

- Technical
- Pre: internal systems, not with parties
- In-pandemic: commercial tools as well
- Data security/protection issue
- User friendliness
- Public access

#### Video hearings public access

- Audience in courtroom
  - Not a good solution in pandemic
  - Link on request for journalists
  - Link on request from clerk's office
    - Clerks did not always respond in time
  - Michigan courts: all courtrooms accessible on Zoom
  - Streaming cases with public interest
  - Still problematic

#### Video or remote hearings



- Issues:
- Not enough hardware
- Connections bad sound!
- Bandwidth
- Unauthorized recording
- Not saving time
- Who else is in the room?



#### Video or remote hearings – the future

- Clear legislation based on experience
- Rights of parties/consent
- Public access/data protection
- Adequate technical equipment and support for all
- The status quo is not that great, either!

#### Beyond the pandemic - digital innovation?

- Courts are geared to process cases
- Courts' work is to look back at what happened in the past
- And to find who is to blame for a wrong
- Instruments: preexisting law and case law
- Retrofitting technology to existing processes?
- What is needed for true digital innovation?

#### Capacity for future innovation

- Awareness of vulnerability to calamities
- Capacity for experimentation
- Acceptance of risk
- And of the possibility of trial and error
- Adequate funding

# Questions / Comments?





Dory Reiling mag. Iur. PhD <u>www.doryreiling.com</u> <u>www.doryreiling.blogspot.com</u> @doryontour dory@dory.reiling.com Mr-online weblog